# Evaluating Free Rides and Observational Advantages in Set Visualizations

**Supplementary Material: Study Materials** 

Andrew Blake  $\cdot$  Gem Stapleton  $\cdot$  Peter Rodgers  $\cdot$  Anestis Touloumis

Received: date / Accepted: date

**Abstract** This document contains the study materials associated with the submitted manuscript.

#### **1** Introduction

This document contains all of the statements and diagrams used in each of the two empirical studies. Each set of statements and diagram is presented alongside the associated question and answer. All of the diagrams are scaled to 45% of the actual size used in the study in order to fit all text and diagrams for any given question on a single page. For study 1, section 2.1 shows the information given to participants. Section 2.2 covers the training phase, section 2.3 presents the performance phase stimuli, and section 2.4 shows the questions designed to identify inattentive participants. Similar sections are included for study 2.

A. Blake University of Brighton, Brighton, UK E-mail: a.l.blake@brighton.ac.uk

G. Stapleton University of Kent, Canterbury, UK E-mail: g.stapleton@kent.ac.uk

P. Rodgers University of Kent, Canterbury, UK E-mail: p.j.rodgers@kent.ac.uk

A. Touloumis University of Brighton, Brighton, UK E-mail: a.touloumis@brighton.ac.uk

This research was partially funded by a Leverhulme Trust Research Project Grant RPG-2016-082 for the project entitled Accessible Reasoning with Diagrams.

# 2 Study 1 Materials

2.1 Information

The information given to the participants at the beginning of the study is as follows:

| Scie  | ntific Study on  | Diagram Visualization   |
|---|--|---|
| Kent  | f Computing  | 岑<br>University of Brighton   |
| This is a scientific study conducted by the Univer-   | rsity of Kent and the Ur   | niversity of Brighton.  |
| Important:  |  |   |
| By consenting to take part, you agree that the d<br>representations of information. You also consen<br>online with any associated research publication.<br>demographic information you provide us with re<br>purposes. By taking part in the study you are pro- | ata we collect from you<br>t to the data being shar<br>These data include infi<br>garding your age, gend<br>oviding your consent for | can be used for the purposes of research into the effectiveness of<br>ed, after anonymization, for the purposes of peer review and to be placed<br>prmation on your responses to the study questions along with basic<br>er, and whether you are colour blind. We will not use your data for other<br>or us to use your data in the way just described. |
| You can participate in this study <b>only once</b> . Mul through all the pages. If you fail to complete the   | ltiple attempts by the sa study after starting you   | me participant will not be permitted. Once starting the study, continue on<br>will not be allowed another attempt and will not be paid.   |
| This study is split up into 28 pages and each pa<br>45 minutes permitted.   | ge takes up to 1 minute  | to complete. The whole study takes about 30 minutes with a maximum of   |
| Read the instructions carefully and answer the or<br>rejected and you will not be paid. 100% of a nur<br>successfully.  | uestion before proceed<br>nber of attention checki   | ing to the next page. Attempts that are not completed carefully will be<br>ng questions must be answered correctly for you to complete the study  |
| You should maintain concentration on the study<br>which case you can have a rest before continuir   | and answer questions ng.   | without delay, unless a question explicitly allows you to take a break, in  |
| Do not use the back button on your browser: you study.  | u cannot access the pre  | evious pages, and if you click on it, you might be unable to complete the   |
| The next 4 pages are for training. You will need  | to read these pages ca   | refully to answer the later questions correctly.  |
| Please choose "Yes" and click on the "Next Pag  | e" button to consent to  | take part and to start the study.   |
|   |  |   |
|   |  |   |
|   |  |   |

Next page (you cannot return to this page afterwards)

#### 2.2 Training

This section contains the statements and diagrams presented to participants for the purposes of training. After attempting each question, participants were given the correct answer, an explanation of the correct answer (with reference to the text and, where appropriate, diagram) and a modified diagram with the regions of interest highlighted. These modified diagrams are presented alongside the explanatory text.

#### Question t1: Text and Diagrams used for Training

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Estonia visited Turkey No one visited both Botswana and Estonia Everyone who visited Estonia visited Botswana No one visited both Botswana and Turkey

- Task Type: Disjoint
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Turkey

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Turkey



Answer: 2

- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Turkey



Everyone who visited Botswana visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Turkey

Turkey Botswana

Question t1: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

#### - Text Group Image:

#### Everyone who visited Botswana visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Turkey

- Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Botswana. Then the first statement tells us that they also visited Estonia. So, from the second statement, this person did not visit Turkey. Therefore, no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

– Linear Diagram Group Image:

| nage:       |           |           |            |         |
|-------------|-----------|-----------|------------|---------|
| Everyone w  | ho visite | d Botswa  | na visited | Estonia |
| No one visi | ted both  | Estonia a | nd Turkey  |         |
|             |           |           |            |         |
|             |           |           |            |         |
|             |           |           |            |         |
| Botswana    |           |           |            |         |
|             |           |           |            |         |
| Estonia     |           |           |            |         |
|             |           |           |            |         |
| Turkey      |           |           |            |         |
|             |           |           |            |         |
|             |           |           |            |         |

– Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Botswana. Then the first statement tells us that they also visited Estonia. So, from the second statement, this person did not visit Turkey. Therefore, no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

In the diagram, the lines for Botswana and Turkey do not overlap, so no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

- Venn Diagram Group Image:



# Venn Diagram Group Explanation: The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Botswana. Then the first statement tells us that they also visited Estonia. So, from the second statement, this person did not visit Turkey. Therefore, no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

In the diagram, the region inside both Botswana and Turkey is completely shaded, so no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

- Euler Diagram Group Image:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Turkey



# Euler Diagram Group Explanation: The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Botswana. Then the first statement tells us that they also visited Estonia. So, from the second statement, this person did not visit Turkey. Therefore, no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

In the diagram, the circles for Botswana and Turkey do not overlap, so no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

#### Question t2: Text and Diagrams used for Training

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Croatia and Niger No one visited both Croatia and Denmark Everyone who visited Denmark visited Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark

- Task Type: Subset
- Answer: 4
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark No one visited both Denmark and Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Croatia

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark No one visited both Denmark and Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Croatia



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark No one visited both Denmark and Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Croatia



– Euler Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark No one visited both Denmark and Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Croatia

Libya Croatia

Question t2: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

- Text Group Image:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark No one visited both Denmark and Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Croatia

- Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Niger. Then the third statement tells us that they also visited Croatia. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

– Linear Diagram Group Image:





#### – Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Niger. Then the third statement tells us that they also visited Croatia. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

In the diagram, the line for Niger is completely overlapped by the line for Denmark, so everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

- Venn Diagram Group Image:



We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Niger. Then the third statement tells us that they also visited Croatia. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

In the diagram, the non-shaded region inside Niger is completely inside completely inside Denmark, so everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

#### - Euler Diagram Group Image:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark No one visited both Denmark and Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Croatia



– Euler Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Niger. Then the third statement tells us that they also visited Croatia. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

In the diagram, the circle for Niger is inside the circle for Denmark, so everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

## Question t3: Text and Diagrams used for Training

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru No one visited both Denmark and Kenya No one visited both Kenya and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Libya

- Task Type: Disjoint

#### Answer: 2

- Text Group:

No one visited both Denmark and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany Everyone who visited Kenya visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Kenya Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Denmark and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany Everyone who visited Kenya visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Kenya Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya



- Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Denmark and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany Everyone who visited Kenya visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Kenya Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya



No one visited both Denmark and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany Everyone who visited Kenya visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Kenya Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya

Libya Peru Den

#### Question t3: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

#### - Text Group Image:

- No one visited both Denmark and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany Everyone who visited Kenya visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Kenya Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya
- Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Denmark. Then the second statement tells us that they also visited Germany. So, from the fourth statement, this person did not visit Kenya. Therefore, no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

#### – Linear Diagram Group Image:

| lage:                                      |          |        |        |         |      |        |
|--|----------|--------|--------|---------|------|--------|
| No one visit                               | ed both  | Denm   | ark a  | nd Per  | u    |        |
| Everyone w                                 | ho visit | ed Der | ımark  | visite  | d Ge | ermany |
| Everyone w                                 | ho visit | ed Ker | iya vi | sited L | iby  | a      |
| No one visit                               | ed both  | Germ   | any a  | nd Ker  | iya  |        |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya |          |        |        |         |      |        |
|  |          |        |        |         |      |        |
|  |          | 1.1    | 1 1    | 1       |      |        |
| р. I                                       |          |        |        |         |      |        |
| Denmark                                    |          |        |        |         |      |        |
| Germany                                    |          |        |        |         |      |        |
|  |          |        |        |         |      |        |
| Kenya                                      |          |        |        |         |      |        |
| Lihva                                      |          |        |        |         |      |        |
| Libya                                      |          |        |        |         |      |        |
| Peru                                       |          |        |        |         |      |        |
|  |          |        |        |         |      |        |
|  |          |        |        |         |      |        |

#### – Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Denmark. Then the second statement tells us that they also visited Germany. So, from the fourth statement, this person did not visit Kenya. Therefore, no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

In the diagram, the lines for Denmark and Kenya do not overlap, so no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.





#### – Venn Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'. We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram

Suppose someone visited Denmark. Then the second statement tells us that they also visited Germany. So, from the fourth statement, this person did not visit Kenya. Therefore, no one

In the diagram, the region inside both Denmark and Kenya is completely shaded, so no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

#### - Euler Diagram Group Image:



visited both Denmark and Kenya.

## - Euler Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Denmark. Then the second statement tells us that they also visited Germany. So, from the fourth statement, this person did not visit Kenya. Therefore, no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

In the diagram, the circles for Denmark and Kenya do not overlap, so no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

## Question t4: Text and Diagrams used for Training

# - Options (All Groups):

| • |  |
|---|--|
|   | Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark |
|   | Everyone who visited Denmark visited Qatar   |
|   | No one visited both Botswana and Qatar       |
|   | No one visited both Qatar and Vietnam        |
|   |  |

Answer: 1

- Task Type: Subset
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana



Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana



#### Question t4: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

- Text Group Image:
- Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana
- Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Vietnam. Then the fifth statement tells us that they also visited Botswana. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

#### - Linear Diagram Group Image:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana



#### – Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Vietnam. Then the fifth statement tells us that they also visited Botswana. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

In the diagram, the line for Vietnam is completely overlapped by the line for Denmark, so everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

#### - Venn Diagram Group Image:



#### - Venn Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram

Suppose someone visited Vietnam. Then the fifth statement tells us that they also visited Botswana. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

In the diagram, the non-shaded region inside Vietnam is completely inside Denmark, so everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

#### - Euler Diagram Group Image:





- Euler Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements and from the diagram.

Suppose someone visited Vietnam. Then the fifth statement tells us that they also visited Botswana. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

In the diagram, the circle for Vietnam is inside the circle for Denmark, so everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

#### 2.3 Performance Phase

This section shows, firstly, the stimuli for ten subset tasks, followed by the stimuli for the ten disjointness tasks. At the end of this section, the stimuli are presented in groups, allowing an overview of the range of tasks to be seen.

#### Question m1

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Vietnam Everyone who visited Jamaica visited France No one visited both Mali and Vietnam No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam

- Task Type: Subset
- Text Group:

Answer: 2

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France Everyone who visited Denmark visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Mali Everyone who visited Mali visited France Everyone who visited Vietnam visited France

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France Everyone who visited Denmark visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Mali Everyone who visited Mali visited France Everyone who visited Vietnam visited France



– Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France Everyone who visited Denmark visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Mali Everyone who visited Mali visited France Everyone who visited Vietnam visited France



Everyone who visited Denmark visited France Everyone who visited Denmark visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Mali Everyone who visited Mali visited France Everyone who visited Vietnam visited France



## $Question\ m2$

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Mali and Oman Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali No one visited both Libya and Oman Everyone who visited Uganda visited Libya

- Answer: 4
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Oman Everyone who visited Mali visited Libya No one visited both Oman and Uganda Everyone who visited Uganda visited Mali

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Oman Everyone who visited Mali visited Libya No one visited both Oman and Uganda Everyone who visited Uganda visited Mali



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Oman Everyone who visited Mali visited Libya No one visited both Oman and Uganda Everyone who visited Uganda visited Mali



Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Oman Everyone who visited Mali visited Libya No one visited both Oman and Uganda Everyone who visited Uganda visited Mali



## $Question\ m3$

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both France and Jamaica Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Italy Everyone who visited Croatia visited France

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Estonia No one visited both Croatia and Italy Everyone who visited France visited Estonia No one visited both France and Italy Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Croatia

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Estonia No one visited both Croatia and Italy Everyone who visited France visited Estonia No one visited both France and Italy Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Croatia



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Estonia No one visited both Croatia and Italy Everyone who visited France visited Estonia No one visited both France and Italy Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Croatia



Everyone who visited Croatia visited Estonia No one visited both Croatia and Italy Everyone who visited France visited Estonia No one visited both France and Italy Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Croatia



## Question m4

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Libya visited France Everyone who visited Libya visited Vietnam No one visited both France and Vietnam No one visited both France and Sudan

- Answer: 1
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam Everyone who visited Libya visited Denmark No one visited both Libya and Sudan No one visited both Sudan and Vietnam

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam Everyone who visited Libya visited Denmark No one visited both Libya and Sudan No one visited both Sudan and Vietnam



– Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam Everyone who visited Libya visited Denmark No one visited both Libya and Sudan No one visited both Sudan and Vietnam



Everyone who visited Denmark visited France No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam Everyone who visited Libya visited Denmark No one visited both Libya and Sudan No one visited both Sudan and Vietnam



## Question m5

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both France and Germany Everyone who visited Botswana visited Sudan Everyone who visited France visited Sudan No one visited both France and Oman

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Germany visited Oman Everyone who visited Sudan visited Sudan Everyone who visited Sudan visited Oman

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Germany visited Oman Everyone who visited Germany visited Sudan Everyone who visited Sudan visited Oman



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Germany visited Oman Everyone who visited Germany visited Sudan Everyone who visited Sudan visited Oman



Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Germany visited Oman Everyone who visited Germany visited Sudan Everyone who visited Sudan visited Oman



#### Question m6

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Libya visited Qatar No one visited both Botswana and Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Turkey Everyone who visited Botswana visited Turkey

- Answer: 4
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

No one visited both Botswana and Croatia Everyone who visited Botswana visited Libya Everyone who visited Croatia and Libya No one visited both Croatia and Qatar Everyone who visited Libya visited Turkey

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Botswana and Croatia Everyone who visited Botswana visited Libya Everyone who visited Croatia and Libya No one visited both Croatia and Qatar Everyone who visited Libya visited Turkey



– Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Botswana and Croatia Everyone who visited Botswana visited Libya Everyone who visited Croatia and Libya No one visited both Croatia and Qatar Everyone who visited Libya visited Turkey



No one visited both Botswana and Croatia Everyone who visited Botswana visited Libya Everyone who visited Croatia and Libya No one visited both Croatia and Qatar Everyone who visited Libya visited Turkey



## Question m7

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Italy visited Mali No one visited both Germany and Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Qatar No one visited both Mali and Qatar

- Answer: 3
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Germany visited Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited Qatar Everyone who visited Mali visited Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Sudan

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Germany visited Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited Qatar Everyone who visited Mali visited Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Sudan



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Germany visited Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited Qatar Everyone who visited Mali visited Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Sudan



Everyone who visited Germany visited Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited Qatar Everyone who visited Mali visited Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Sudan



#### Question m8

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Oman and Germany Everyone who visited Denmark visited Oman Everyone who visited Oman visited Germany No one visited both Denmark and Germany

- Answer: 3
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Germany and Mali Everyone who visited Oman visited Denmark Everyone who visited Uganda visited Denmark No one visited both Uganda and Oman

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Germany and Mali Everyone who visited Oman visited Denmark Everyone who visited Uganda visited Denmark No one visited both Uganda and Oman



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Germany and Mali Everyone who visited Oman visited Denmark Everyone who visited Uganda visited Denmark No one visited both Uganda and Oman



Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Germany and Mali Everyone who visited Oman visited Denmark Everyone who visited Uganda visited Denmark No one visited both Uganda and Oman



#### $Question\ m9$

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Germany and Libya No one visited both Germany and Hungary Everyone who visited Albania visited Libya Everyone who visited France visited Germany

#### Answer: 3

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

No one visited both Albania and France No one visited both Albania and Germany Everyone who visited Albania visited Hungary No one visited both France and Libya Everyone who visited Hungary visited Libya

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and France No one visited both Albania and Germany Everyone who visited Albania visited Hungary No one visited both France and Libya Everyone who visited Hungary visited Libya



- Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and France No one visited both Albania and Germany Everyone who visited Albania visited Hungary No one visited both France and Libya Everyone who visited Hungary visited Libya



No one visited both Albania and France No one visited both Albania and Germany Everyone who visited Albania visited Hungary No one visited both France and Libya Everyone who visited Hungary visited Libya



## ${\rm Question}\ {\rm m10}$

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Uganda visited Oman No one visited both Oman and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Russia No one visited both France and Russia

#### Answer: 1

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Peru and Russia Everyone who visited Russia visited France Everyone who visited Peru visited Oman Everyone who visited Uganda visited Peru

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Peru and Russia Everyone who visited Russia visited France Everyone who visited Peru visited Oman Everyone who visited Uganda visited Peru



- Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Peru and Russia Everyone who visited Russia visited France Everyone who visited Peru visited Oman Everyone who visited Uganda visited Peru


No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Peru and Russia Everyone who visited Russia visited France Everyone who visited Peru visited Oman Everyone who visited Uganda visited Peru



### Question m11

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Oman No one visited both Croatia and Denmark No one visited both Mali and Oman Everyone who visited Denmark visited Oman

#### Answer: 3

– Text Group:

No one visited both Albania and Croatia No one visited both Albania and Denmark No one visited both Albania and Oman Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark Everyone who visited Mali visited Albania

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and Croatia No one visited both Albania and Denmark No one visited both Albania and Oman Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark Everyone who visited Mali visited Albania



– Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and Croatia No one visited both Albania and Denmark No one visited both Albania and Oman Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark Everyone who visited Mali visited Albania



No one visited both Albania and Croatia No one visited both Albania and Denmark No one visited both Albania and Oman Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark Everyone who visited Mali visited Albania



## Question m12 $\,$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Peru visited Turkey Everyone who visited Oman visited Turkey No one visited both Kenya and Peru No one visited both Croatia and Oman

#### Answer: 4

– Text Group:

No one visited both Croatia and Kenya No one visited both Croatia and Peru Everyone who visited Croatia visited Turkey Everyone who visited Oman visited Kenya No one visited both Oman and Peru

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Croatia and Kenya No one visited both Croatia and Peru Everyone who visited Croatia visited Turkey Everyone who visited Oman visited Kenya No one visited both Oman and Peru



– Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Croatia and Kenya No one visited both Croatia and Peru Everyone who visited Croatia visited Turkey Everyone who visited Oman visited Kenya No one visited both Oman and Peru



No one visited both Croatia and Kenya No one visited both Croatia and Peru Everyone who visited Croatia visited Turkey Everyone who visited Oman visited Kenya No one visited both Oman and Peru



### $Question\ m13$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Botswana and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany No one visited both Mali and Russia

#### Answer: 4

– Text Group:

No one visited both Botswana and Germany Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru Everyone who visited Mali visited Botswana Everyone who visited Mali visited Peru Everyone who visited Russia visited Germany

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Botswana and Germany Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru Everyone who visited Mali visited Botswana Everyone who visited Mali visited Peru Everyone who visited Russia visited Germany



- Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Botswana and Germany Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru Everyone who visited Mali visited Botswana Everyone who visited Mali visited Peru Everyone who visited Russia visited Germany



No one visited both Botswana and Germany Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru Everyone who visited Mali visited Botswana Everyone who visited Mali visited Peru Everyone who visited Russia visited Germany



## $Question\ m14$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Italy and Qatar No one visited both Denmark and Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Qatar Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Denmark and Qatar No one visited both Italy and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Peru No one visited both Qatar and Peru

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Denmark and Qatar No one visited both Italy and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Peru No one visited both Qatar and Peru



– Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Denmark and Qatar No one visited both Italy and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Peru No one visited both Qatar and Peru



Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Denmark and Qatar No one visited both Italy and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Peru No one visited both Qatar and Peru



## Question m15

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Niger visited Oman No one visited both Albania and Oman No one visited both Niger and Russia Everyone who visited France visited Russia

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

No one visited both Albania and France Everyone who visited Albania visited Niger Everyone who visited Albania visited Russia No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Oman and Russia

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and France Everyone who visited Albania visited Niger Everyone who visited Albania visited Russia No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Oman and Russia



- Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and France Everyone who visited Albania visited Niger Everyone who visited Albania visited Russia No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Oman and Russia



No one visited both Albania and France Everyone who visited Albania visited Niger Everyone who visited Albania visited Russia No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Oman and Russia



### ${\it Question m16}$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Hungary visited France No one visited both France and Jamaica Everyone who visited Albania visited Jamaica No one visited both Albania and France

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited France Everyone who visited France visited Hungary No one visited both Hungary and Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Kenya No one visited both Jamaica and Kenya

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited France Everyone who visited France visited Hungary No one visited both Hungary and Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Kenya No one visited both Jamaica and Kenya



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited France Everyone who visited France visited Hungary No one visited both Hungary and Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Kenya No one visited both Jamaica and Kenya



Everyone who visited Albania visited France Everyone who visited France visited Hungary No one visited both Hungary and Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Kenya No one visited both Jamaica and Kenya



### Question m17

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited France visited Kenya Everyone who visited France visited Mali No one visited both Botswana and Kenya No one visited both Botswana and Italy

#### Answer: 3

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Botswana visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited France No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Kenya and Mali

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Botswana visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited France No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Kenya and Mali



– Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Botswana visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited France No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Kenya and Mali



Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Botswana visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited France No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Kenya and Mali



## $Question\ m18$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Mali visited Niger No one visited both Jamaica and Peru No one visited both Hungary and Peru Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Niger

#### Answer: 3

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Hungary visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali Everyone who visited Hungary visited Niger No one visited both Niger and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Hungary visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali Everyone who visited Hungary visited Niger No one visited both Niger and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Hungary visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali Everyone who visited Hungary visited Niger No one visited both Niger and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali



Everyone who visited Hungary visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali Everyone who visited Hungary visited Niger No one visited both Niger and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali

Nige Hungary Mali Peru

## ${\it Question \ m19}$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Albania and Kenya No one visited both Germany and Italy Everyone who visited Albania visited Italy Everyone who visited Italy visited Kenya

#### Answer: 1

– Text Group:

No one visited both Albania and Germany No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Italy and Russia Everyone who visited Kenya visited Germany Everyone who visited Russia visited Albania

– Linear Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and Germany No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Italy and Russia Everyone who visited Kenya visited Germany Everyone who visited Russia visited Albania



- Venn Diagram Group:

No one visited both Albania and Germany No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Italy and Russia Everyone who visited Kenya visited Germany Everyone who visited Russia visited Albania



No one visited both Albania and Germany No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Italy and Russia Everyone who visited Kenya visited Germany Everyone who visited Russia visited Albania



## $Question\ m20$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Albania and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Uganda Everyone who visited Croatia visited Uganda No one visited both Albania and Yemen

#### Answer: 1

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen



Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen



2.3.1 Text Stimuli

This page shows all of the textual stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions.

| Everyone who visited Denmark visited France   | Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya   | Everyone who visited Croatia visited Estonia |  |
|---|--|--|--|
| Everyone who visited Denmark visited Jamaica  | No one visited both Germany and Oman   | No one visited both Croatia and Italy        |  |
| Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Mali   | Everyone who visited Mali visited Libya  | Everyone who visited France visited Estonia  |  |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited France  | No one visited both Oman and Uganda  | No one visited both France and Italy         |  |
| Everyone who visited Vietnam visited France   | Everyone who visited Uganda visited Mali   | Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Croatia |  |
| Everyone who visited Denmark visited France   | Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany  | No one visited both Botswana and Croatia     |  |
| No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam   | Everyone who visited Botswana visited France   | Everyone who visited Botswana visited Libya  |  |
| Everyone who visited Libya visited Denmark  | Everyone who visited Germany visited Oman  | Everyone who visited Croatia and Libya       |  |
| No one visited both Libya and Sudan   | Everyone who visited Germany visited Sudan   | No one visited both Croatia and Qatar        |  |
| No one visited both Sudan and Vietnam   | Everyone who visited Sudan visited Oman  | Everyone who visited Libya visited Turkey    |  |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Haly   | Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany   | No one visited both Albania and France       |  |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali   | No one visited both Germany and Mali   | No one visited both Albania and Germany      |  |
| Everyone who visited Italy visited Qutar  | Everyone who visited Oman visited Denmark  | Everyone who visited Albania visited Hungary |  |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited Qutar   | Everyone who visited Uganda visited Denmark  | No one visited both France and Libya         |  |
| No one visited both Qutar and Sudan   | No one visited both Uganda and Oman  | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Libya   |  |
| No one visited both France and Oman   | No one visited both Albania and Croatia  | No one visited both Croatia and Kenya        |  |
| No one visited both Peru and Russia   | No one visited both Albania and Denmark  | No one visited both Croatia and Peru         |  |
| Everyone who visited Russia visited France  | No one visited both Albania and Oman   | Everyone who visited Croatia visited Turkey  |  |
| Everyone who visited Peru visited Oman  | Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark   | Everyone who visited Oman visited Kenya      |  |
| Everyone who visited Uganda visited Peru  | Everyone who visited Mali visited Albania  | No one visited both Oman and Peru            |  |
| No one visited both Botswana and Germany  | Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany   | No one visited both Albania and France       |  |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru   | No one visited both Denmark and Qatar  | Everyone who visited Albania visited Niger   |  |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited Botswana  | No one visited both Italy and Peru   | Everyone who visited Albania visited Russia  |  |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited Peru  | Everyone who visited Denmark visited Peru  | No one visited both France and Oman          |  |
| Everyone who visited Russia visited Germany   | No one visited both Qatar and Peru   | No one visited both Oman and Russia          |  |
| Everyone who visited Albania visited France   | Everyone who visited Botswana visited France   | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Jamaica |  |
| Everyone who visited France visited Hungary   | Everyone who visited Botswana visited Mali   | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali    |  |
| No one visited both Hungary and Jamaica   | Everyone who visited Italy visited France  | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Niger   |  |
| Everyone who visited Hungary visited Kenya  | No one visited both Italy and Kenya  | No one visited both Niger and Peru           |  |
| No one visited both Jamaica and Kenya   | No one visited both Kenya and Mali   | Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali       |  |
| No one visited both Albania and Germany<br>No one visited both Italy and Kenya<br>No one visited both Italy and Russia<br>Everyone who visited Kenya visited Germany<br>Everyone who visited Russia visited Albania | Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia<br>No one visited both Albania and Uganda<br>No one visited both Croatia and Peru<br>No one visited both Peru and Yemen<br>No visited both Uganda and Yemen | the end                                      |  |

2.3.2 Linear Diagrams and Text Stimuli

This page shows all of the L&T stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions.

## Andrew Blake et al.



2.3.3 Venn Diagrams and Text Stimuli

This page shows all of the V&T stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions. Note that these diagrams are scaled differently to the other treatments in order to fit them on one page.



2.3.4 Euler Diagrams and Text Stimuli

This page shows all of the E&T stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions.



## 2.4 Inattentive Questions

## ${\it Question \ s1}$

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Kenya visited Niger No one visited both Albania and Kenya No one visited both Hungary and Peru Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Niger Please choose this option

- Task Type: Inattentive
- Text Group:

This is an Attention Check Question It is not timed, You May Rest Now Please Click on the Indicated Option You Must Do This In Order to be Paid

Answer: 5

– Linear Diagram Group:

This is an Attention Check Question It is not timed, You May Rest Now Please Click on the Indicated Option You Must Do This In Order to be Paid



– Venn Diagram Group:





## $Question \ s2$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Inattentive

Everyone who visited Libya visited Croatia No one visited both Libya and Denmark No one visited both Qatar and Croatia Everyone who visited Libya visited Please choose this option

#### Answer: 5

- Text Group:

This is an Attention Check Question It is not timed, You May Rest Now Please Click on the Indicated Option You Must Do This In Order to be Paid

– Linear Diagram Group:

This is an Attention Check Question It is not timed, You May Rest Now Please Click on the Indicated Option You Must Do This In Order to be Paid



– Venn Diagram Group:



# 3 Study 2 Materials

3.1 Information

The information given to the participants at the beginning of the study is as follows:

| Scientific Study on Diagram Visualization   |  |  |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| University of Computing University of Brighton  |  |  |  |  |  |
| This is a scientific study conducted by the University of Kent and the University of Brighton.  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Important:  |  |  |  |  |  |
| By consenting to take part, you agree that the data we collect from you can be used for the purposes of research into the effectiveness of representations of information. You also consent to the data being shared, after anonymization, for the purposes of peer review and to be placed online with any associated research publication. These data include information on your responses to the study questions along with basic demographic information you provide us with regarding your age, gender, and whether you are colour blind. We will not use your data for other purposes. By taking part in the study you are providing your consent for us to use your data in the way just described. |  |  |  |  |  |
| You can participate in this study <b>only once</b> . Multiple attempts by the same participant will not be permitted. Once starting the study, continue on through all the pages. If you fail to complete the study after starting you will not be allowed another attempt and will not be paid.  |  |  |  |  |  |
| This study is split up into 28 pages and each page takes up to 1 minute to complete. The whole study takes about 20 minutes with a maximum of 45 minutes permitted.   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Read the instructions carefully and answer the question before proceeding to the next page. Attempts that are not completed carefully will be rejected and you will not be paid. 100% of a number of attention checking questions must be answered correctly for you to complete the study successfully.  |  |  |  |  |  |
| You should maintain concentration on the study and answer questions without delay, unless a question explicitly allows you to take a break, in which case you can have a rest before continuing.  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Do not use the back button on your browser: you cannot access the previous pages, and if you click on it, you might be unable to complete the study.  |  |  |  |  |  |
| The next 4 pages are for training. You will need to read these pages carefully to answer the later questions correctly.   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Please choose "Yes" and click on the "Next Page" button to consent to take part and to start the study.   |  |  |  |  |  |
|   |  |  |  |  |  |
|   |  |  |  |  |  |
|   |  |  |  |  |  |

(you cannot return to this page afterwards)

69

#### 3.2 Training

This section contains the statements and diagrams presented to participants for the purposes of training. After attempting each question, participants were given the correct answer, an explanation of the correct answer (with reference to the text or the diagram displayed).

Question t1: Text and Diagrams used for Training



Question t1: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

- Text Group Image:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Turkey

- Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Botswana. Then the first statement tells us that they also visited Estonia. So, from the second statement, this person did not visit Turkey. Therefore, no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

– Linear Diagram Group Image:

| Botswana |  |  |
|----------|--|--|
| Estonia  |  |  |
| Turkey   |  |  |
|          |  |  |

- Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

In the diagram, the lines for Botswana and Turkey do not overlap, so no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

- Venn Diagram Group Image:



– Venn Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

In the diagram, the region inside both Botswana and Turkey is completely shaded, so no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

– Euler Diagram Group Image:



Euler Diagram Group Explanation: The correct answer is 'No one visited both Botswana and Turkey'.

In the diagram, the circles for Botswana and Turkey do not overlap, so no one visited both Botswana and Turkey.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

# Question t2: Text and Diagrams used for Training

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Croatia and Niger No one visited both Croatia and Denmark Everyone who visited Denmark visited Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark

- Task Type: Subset
- Answer: 4
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark No one visited both Denmark and Libya Everyone who visited Niger visited Croatia

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:



– Euler Diagram Group:


Question t2: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

- Text Group Image:



- Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Niger. Then the third statement tells us that they also visited Croatia. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

- Linear Diagram Group Image:



- Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark'.

In the diagram, the line for Niger is completely overlapped by the line for Denmark, so everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

- Venn Diagram Group Image:



– Venn Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark'.

In the diagram, the non-shaded region inside Niger is completely inside completely inside Denmark, so everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

- Euler Diagram Group Image:



Euler Diagram Group Explanation: The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark'.

In the diagram, the circle for Niger is inside the circle for Denmark, so everyone who visited Niger visited Denmark.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

## Question t3: Text and Diagrams used for Training

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru No one visited both Denmark and Kenya No one visited both Kenya and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Libya

- Task Type: Disjoint

### Answer: 2

- Text Group:

No one visited both Denmark and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany Everyone who visited Kenya visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Kenya Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya

- Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





Question t3: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

- Text Group Image:

| No one visited both Denmark and Peru         |
|--|
| Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany |
| Everyone who visited Kenya visited Libya     |
| No one visited both Germany and Kenya        |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya   |

- Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Denmark. Then the second statement tells us that they also visited Germany. So, from the fourth statement, this person did not visit Kenya. Therefore, no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

- Linear Diagram Group Image:



- Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'.

In the diagram, the lines for Denmark and Kenya do not overlap, so no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

- Venn Diagram Group Image:



- Venn Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'

In the diagram, the region inside both Denmark and Kenya is completely shaded, so no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

– Euler Diagram Group Image:



- Euler Diagram Group Explanation: The correct answer is 'No one visited both Denmark and Kenya'.

In the diagram, the circles for Denmark and Kenya do not overlap, so no one visited both Denmark and Kenya.

Click "Next page" to move on to the next training question.

## Question t4: Text and Diagrams used for Training

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark Everyone who visited Denmark visited Qatar No one visited both Botswana and Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Vietnam

- Task Type: Subset
- Answer: 1
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana

- Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





Question t4: Text and Diagrams Used to Explain The Answer

- Text Group Image:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Denmark Everyone who visited Germany visited Botswana No one visited both Germany and Vietnam No one visited both Germany and Qatar Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Botswana

– Text Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'.

We can make this deduction from the statements.

Suppose someone visited Vietnam. Then the fifth statement tells us that they also visited Botswana. So, from the first statement, this person also visited Denmark. Therefore, everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

- Linear Diagram Group Image:



- Linear Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'.

In the diagram, the line for Vietnam is completely overlapped by the line for Denmark, so everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

Click "Next page" to move on to the first real question.

- Venn Diagram Group Image:



- Venn Diagram Group Explanation:

The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'.

In the diagram, the non-shaded region inside Vietnam is completely inside Denmark, so everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

Click "Next page" to move on to the first real question.

– Euler Diagram Group Image:



- Euler Diagram Group Explanation: The correct answer is 'Everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark'.

In the diagram, the circle for Vietnam is inside the circle for Denmark, so everyone who visited Vietnam visited Denmark.

Click "Next page" to move on to the first real question.

### 3.3 Performance Phase

This section shows, firstly, the stimuli for ten subset tasks, followed by the stimuli for the ten disjointness tasks. At the end of this section, the stimuli are presented in groups, allowing an overview of the range of tasks to be seen.

Question m1

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Vietnam Everyone who visited Jamaica visited France No one visited both Mali and Vietnam No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam

- Task Type: Subset

Answer: 2

- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France Everyone who visited Denmark visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Mali Everyone who visited Mali visited France Everyone who visited Vietnam visited France

- Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Mali and Oman Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali No one visited both Libya and Oman Everyone who visited Uganda visited Libya

#### Answer: 4

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya No one visited both Germany and Oman Everyone who visited Mali visited Libya No one visited both Oman and Uganda Everyone who visited Uganda visited Mali

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both France and Jamaica Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Estonia No one visited both Estonia and Italy Everyone who visited Croatia visited France

Answer: 2

83

- Task Type: Subset
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Estonia No one visited both Croatia and Italy Everyone who visited France visited Estonia No one visited both France and Italy Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Croatia

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:



France

Italy

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Libya visited France Everyone who visited Libya visited Vietnam No one visited both France and Vietnam No one visited both France and Sudan

#### Answer: 1

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Denmark visited France No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam Everyone who visited Libya visited Denmark No one visited both Libya and Sudan No one visited both Sudan and Vietnam

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both France and Germany Everyone who visited Botswana visited Sudan Everyone who visited France visited Sudan No one visited both France and Oman

Answer: 2

- Task Type: Subset
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Germany visited Oman Everyone who visited Germany visited Sudan

Everyone who visited Sudan visited Oman

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





## ${\it Question}\ {\it m6}$

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Libya visited Qatar No one visited both Botswana and Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Turkey Everyone who visited Botswana visited Turkey

#### Answer: 4

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

No one visited both Botswana and Croatia Everyone who visited Botswana visited Libya Everyone who visited Croatia and Libya No one visited both Croatia and Qatar Everyone who visited Libya visited Turkey

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





 ${\it Question}\ {\rm m7}$ 

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Italy visited Mali No one visited both Germany and Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Qatar No one visited both Mali and Qatar

Answer: 3

- Task Type: Subset
- Text Group:

Everyone who visited Germany visited Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited Qatar Everyone who visited Mali visited Qatar No one visited both Qatar and Sudan

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Oman and Germany Everyone who visited Denmark visited Oman Everyone who visited Oman visited Germany No one visited both Denmark and Germany

#### Answer: 3

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Germany and Mali Everyone who visited Oman visited Denmark Everyone who visited Uganda visited Denmark No one visited both Uganda and Oman

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:

- Euler Diagram Group:

Uganda Oman Denmark Oman Uganda Mali  ${\it Question}\ {\it m9}$ 

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Germany and Libya No one visited both Germany and Hungary Everyone who visited Albania visited Libya Everyone who visited France visited Germany

- Answer: 3
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

No one visited both Albania and France No one visited both Albania and Germany Everyone who visited Albania visited Hungary No one visited both France and Libya Everyone who visited Hungary visited Libya

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





## ${\it Question m10}$

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited Uganda visited Oman No one visited both Oman and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Russia No one visited both France and Russia

#### Answer: 1

– Text Group:

- Task Type: Subset

No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Peru and Russia Everyone who visited Russia visited France Everyone who visited Peru visited Oman Everyone who visited Uganda visited Peru

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Croatia visited Oman No one visited both Croatia and Denmark No one visited both Mali and Oman Everyone who visited Denmark visited Oman

Answer: 3

Omar

– Text Group:

No one visited both Albania and Croatia No one visited both Albania and Denmark No one visited both Albania and Oman Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark Everyone who visited Mali visited Albania

– Linear Diagram Group:



Albania

- Venn Diagram Group:

– Euler Diagram Group:

Albania Denmark

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Peru visited Turkey Everyone who visited Oman visited Turkey No one visited both Kenya and Peru No one visited both Croatia and Oman

#### Answer: 4

– Text Group:

No one visited both Croatia and Kenya No one visited both Croatia and Peru Everyone who visited Croatia visited Turkey Everyone who visited Oman visited Kenya No one visited both Oman and Peru

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Botswana and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany No one visited both Mali and Russia

- Answer: 4
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Botswana and Germany Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru Everyone who visited Mali visited Botswana Everyone who visited Mali visited Peru Everyone who visited Russia visited Germany

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:



- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Italy and Qatar No one visited both Denmark and Italy Everyone who visited Germany visited Qatar Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany No one visited both Denmark and Qatar No one visited both Italy and Peru Everyone who visited Denmark visited Peru No one visited both Qatar and Peru

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Niger visited Oman No one visited both Albania and Oman No one visited both Niger and Russia Everyone who visited France visited Russia

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

No one visited both Albania and France Everyone who visited Albania visited Niger Everyone who visited Albania visited Russia No one visited both France and Oman No one visited both Oman and Russia

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





## ${\it Question m16}$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Hungary visited France No one visited both France and Jamaica Everyone who visited Albania visited Jamaica No one visited both Albania and France

#### Answer: 2

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited France Everyone who visited France visited Hungary No one visited both Hungary and Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Kenya No one visited both Jamaica and Kenya

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





 ${\it Question \ m17}$ 

- Options (All Groups):

Everyone who visited France visited Kenya Everyone who visited France visited Mali No one visited both Botswana and Kenya No one visited both Botswana and Italy

- Answer: 3
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Botswana visited France Everyone who visited Botswana visited Mali Everyone who visited Italy visited France No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Kenya and Mali

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





## ${\it Question \ m18}$

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

Everyone who visited Mali visited Niger No one visited both Jamaica and Peru No one visited both Hungary and Peru Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Niger

#### Answer: 3

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Hungary visited Jamaica Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali Everyone who visited Hungary visited Niger No one visited both Niger and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





 ${\it Question \ m19}$ 

- Options (All Groups):

No one visited both Albania and Kenya No one visited both Germany and Italy Everyone who visited Albania visited Italy Everyone who visited Italy visited Kenya

- Answer: 1
- Text Group:

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Albania and Germany No one visited both Italy and Kenya No one visited both Italy and Russia Everyone who visited Kenya visited Germany Everyone who visited Russia visited Albania

– Linear Diagram Group:



- Venn Diagram Group:





- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Disjoint

No one visited both Albania and Peru Everyone who visited Peru visited Uganda Everyone who visited Croatia visited Uganda No one visited both Albania and Yemen

#### Answer: 1

– Text Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen

– Linear Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen



- Venn Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen



# – Euler Diagram Group:

Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia No one visited both Albania and Uganda No one visited both Croatia and Peru No one visited both Peru and Yemen No visited both Uganda and Yemen



3.3.1 Text Stimuli

This page shows all of the textual stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions.

| Everyone who visited Denmark visited France  | Everyone who visited Germany visited Libya    | Everyone who visited Croatia visited Estonia |
|--|---|--|
| Everyone who visited Denmark visited Jamaica | No one visited both Germany and Oman          | No one visited both Croatia and Italy        |
| Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Mali    | Everyone who visited Mali visited Libya       | Everyone who visited France visited Estonia  |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited France     | No one visited both Oman and Uganda           | No one visited both France and Italy         |
| Everyone who visited Vietnam visited France  | Everyone who visited Uganda visited Mali      | Everyone who visited Jamaica visited Croatia |
|  |   |  |
| Everyone who visited Denmark visited France  | Everyone who visited Botswana visited Germany | No one visited both Botswana and Croatia     |
| No one visited both Denmark and Vietnam      | Everyone who visited Botswana visited France  | Everyone who visited Botswana visited Libya  |
| Everyone who visited Libya visited Denmark   | Everyone who visited Germany visited Oman     | Everyone who visited Croatia and Libya       |
| No one visited both Libva and Sudan          | Everyone who visited Germany visited Sudan    | No one visited both Croatia and Oatar        |
| No one visited both Sudan and Vietnam        | Everyone who visited Sudan visited Oman       | Everyone who visited Libya visited Turkey    |
|  | Everyone who visited bleam visited ontain     |  |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Italy   | Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany  | No one visited both Albania and France       |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Mali    | No one visited both Germany and Mali          | No one visited both Albania and Germany      |
| Everyone who visited Italy visited Oatar     | Everyone who visited Oman visited Denmark     | Everyone who visited Albania visited Hungary |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited Oatar      | Everyone who visited Uganda visited Denmark   | No one visited both France and Libya         |
| No one visited both Oatar and Sudan          | No one visited both Uganda and Oman           | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Libya   |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·        | ···· ····                                     |  |
| No one visited both France and Oman          | No one visited both Albania and Croatia       | No one visited both Croatia and Kenya        |
| No one visited both Peru and Russia          | No one visited both Albania and Denmark       | No one visited both Croatia and Peru         |
| Everyone who visited Russia visited France   | No one visited both Albania and Oman          | Everyone who visited Croatia visited Turkey  |
| Everyone who visited Peru visited Oman       | Everyone who visited Croatia visited Denmark  | Everyone who visited Oman visited Kenya      |
| Everyone who visited Lleanda visited Peru    | Everyone who visited Mali visited Albania     | No one visited both Oman and Peru            |
|  |   |  |
| No one visited both Botswana and Germany     | Everyone who visited Denmark visited Germany  | No one visited both Albania and France       |
| Everyone who visited Germany visited Peru    | No one visited both Denmark and Qatar         | Everyone who visited Albania visited Niger   |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited Botswana   | No one visited both Italy and Peru            | Everyone who visited Albania visited Russia  |
| Everyone who visited Mali visited Peru       | Everyone who visited Denmark visited Peru     | No one visited both France and Oman          |
| Everyone who visited Russia visited Germany  | No one visited both Qatar and Peru            | No one visited both Oman and Russia          |
|  |   |  |
| Everyone who visited Albania visited France  | Everyone who visited Botswana visited France  | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Jamaica |
| Everyone who visited France visited Hungary  | Everyone who visited Botswana visited Mali    | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali    |
| No one visited both Hungary and Jamaica      | Everyone who visited Italy visited France     | Everyone who visited Hungary visited Niger   |
| Everyone who visited Hungary visited Kenya   | No one visited both Italy and Kenya           | No one visited both Niger and Peru           |
| No one visited both Jamaica and Kenya        | No one visited both Kenya and Mali            | Everyone who visited Peru visited Mali       |
|  | -   |  |
| No one visited both Albania and Germany      | Everyone who visited Albania visited Croatia  |  |
| No one visited both Italy and Kenya          | No one visited both Albania and Uganda        |  |
| No one visited both Italy and Russia         | No one visited both Croatia and Peru          |  |
| Everyone who visited Kenya visited Germany   | No one visited both Peru and Yemen            | 411  |
| Everyone who visited Russia visited Albania  | No visited both Uganda and Yemen              | i une end                                    |
|  |   |  |

3.3.2 Linear Diagrams Stimuli

This page shows all of the L stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions.

| Denmark  | Germany<br>Libys<br>Mali<br>Oman<br>Uganda    | Creati<br>Estatia<br>Vrance<br>Taby<br>Jamaica   |
|--|---|--|
| Demark   | Batwaan                                       | Botrozan<br>Creatis<br>Libya<br>Qutar<br>Tarkey  |
| Germany<br>Italy<br>Mali<br>Qatar<br>Sudan     | Demark  | Athania France<br>Germany Hungary Libya  |
| Prance<br>Oman<br>Peru<br>Russia<br>Uganda     | Albania<br>Crastia<br>Denmark<br>Mali<br>Oman | Cruatia - Cruati |
| Botwana<br>Germany<br>Maii<br>Peru<br>Russia   | Penark<br>Germany<br>Italy<br>Pera<br>Qatar   | Albania<br>France<br>Niger<br>Oman<br>Rmsia  |
| Albania  | Botwana<br>France<br>Italy<br>Kenya<br>Mali   | Hungary  |
| Albania<br>Germany<br>Italy<br>Kenya<br>Ravsia | Albania<br>Cruatia<br>Peru<br>Uganda<br>Vemen | the end  |

# 3.3.3 Venn Diagrams Stimuli

This page shows all of the V stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions.



3.3.4 Euler Diagrams Stimuli

This page shows all of the E stimuli for the 20 performance phase questions.



## 3.4 Inattentive Questions

Question s1

- Options (All Groups):

Choose this Option This is an Attention Check Everyone who visited Hungary visited Mali No one visited both Jamaica and Hungary Everyone who visited Hungary visited Albania None of the above

- Task Type: Inattentive
- Text Group:

Answer: 1

No one visited both Botswana and Estonia Everyone who visited Zambia visited Botswana No one visited both Italy and Qatar Everyone who visited Qatar visited Estonia No one visited both Zambia and Qatar

– Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:





 $Question \ s2$ 

- Options (All Groups):

- Task Type: Inattentive

Choose this Option This is an Attention Check Everyone who visited Peru visited Botswana No one visited both Botswana and Italy No one visited both Albania and Italy None of the above

### Answer: 1

- Text Group:

No one visited both Germany and Kenya Everyone who visited France visited Germany Everyone who visited Turkey visited Kenya Everyone who visited Uganda visited Germany No one visited both Uganda and Turkey

- Linear Diagram Group:



– Venn Diagram Group:

